The Identification of Higher Order Thinking Skill Domain in The Eleventh Grade English Lesson Plan at SMK N 1 Singaraja

Cok Istri Rahma Pratami Surya¹
Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
rahma.pratami02@gmail.com

Nyoman Karina Wedhanti²
Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
karina.wedhanti@undiksha.ac.id

Putu Adi Krisna Juniarta³
Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Indonesia
adi.krisna@undiksha.ac.id

ABSTRACT

This research aimed to identify the cognitive domains of Higher Order Thinking Skills that appear in the four English Lesson Plans in eleventh grade and the most dominant cognitive domain of Higher Order Thinking Skill used in the four English lesson plans in eleventh grade. This research used descriptive qualitative research design. The setting of this research is in SMK N 1 Singaraja. The subject of this research were the English lesson plans and one of the teachers in SMK N 1 Singaraja. The data were collected by using documentation, checklist, and interview guide. The results of this research are, (1) There are two cognitive domains (C4 & C6) appear in those four lesson plans, (2) The most cognitive domain appear in the four English lesson plans is C6 with the operational verb is arrange.

Keywords: Cognitive Domain, Higher Order Thinking Skill, Lesson Plan

INTRODUCTION

The curriculum in education which always changing is often be the subject of criticism by educational actors. According to Abong (2015) says that currently the school curriculum is a form of imposition and a fairly heavy emphasis on its implementation. The previous curriculum was the 2016 curriculum or KTSP, which has been replaced with the 2013 curriculum and is still ongoing nowadays. In the 2016 curriculum or KTSP, the preparation is required to be creative from the schools and teachers, so that bring a lot of confusion for the teachers. While, the 2013 curriculum is no longer too dependent on teachers, but rather emphasizes the students to be more creative than the teachers. This current education is quite different from the previous one. What we now know is that we are now using curriculum 13. In this curriculum it needed a change in the learning system, in which it can be a tool to change the students' mindset. Students are required to
be more active than their teachers, but it seems that students are still not used to it. And now the higher order thinking skill is needed to change from teacher centered to students centered. That’s why in this curriculum required critical and higher thinking for students especially for senior high school.

As explained above, it is the same as what Bloom's Taxonomy said that learning in the 2013 curriculum pays attention to 3 aspects. The first is Cognitive (knowledge), the second is Affective (attitudes and feelings), and the third is Psychomotor (skills). Of the three aspects in the 2013 curriculum, it can lead to higher order thinking skills and also make students think more critically (critical thinking). Ganapathy and Kaur (2014) mention that to make students more creative and innovative, Higher Order Thinking Skills are one of the most important things for students in learning (Bailey & Mentz, 2015).

According to Rofiah et al. (2013), Higher Order Thinking Skills are such a high-level thinking skill that do not only rely on memorization in thinking, but how students is package or mix and connect any knowledge that they get. According to Wahyuningsih et al (2019), higher order thinking skill can be said the thinking prose which develop from the various concepts and methods of cognitive and taxonomy in higher cognitive level. As we know these days, what is happening now is that students are more active than their teachers (student center). So that is why students must have the ability to think critically because students will explore themselves in a wider direction. Likewise, Aslan (2018) said, that critical thinking can make someone think rationally so that when there is a debate in a problem, they can find a solution without using emotion, but the ideas obtained according to the facts.

According to Bloom, skills are divided into two parts. The first part is low order thinking skills, which are remembering, understanding, and applying. And the second is higher order thinking skills, which are, analyzing, evaluating, and creating. Besides, through a book entitled A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy in which it was written by Krathwohl (2002), it shows that analyzing (C4), evaluating (C5), and creating (C6) are the indicators to measure the higher order thinking skills. The revision of Bloom's taxonomy was done to know the conditions for how the cognitive domain were more alive and applicable for educators and learning practices, so that learning objectives and strategies become more focused and efficient (Saraswati, 2015; Wahyuningsih et al, 2019).

**Hots Domain**

In the modern categorization, higher order thinking skills no longer only involve one domain (cognitive process domains only) but HOTS is a slice between the three components of the top cognitive process domains (analyzing, evaluating, and creating) and the three components of the highest domains of the knowledge (conceptual, procedural, and metacognitive) (Gulo, 2002; indriyana & Kuswandono, 2019). The same explanation stated in “Bloom’s Taxonomy as refined by Anderson et al. (2001), that the domain of the thinking process in consists of ability of remembering (C1), understanding (C2), applying (C3), analyzing (C4), evaluating (C5), and creating (C6).

The researcher found the Table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Anderson et al (2001) to identify the English lesson plans were collected from the teacher at SMKN 1 Singaraja. Based on Anderson et al. (2001), there are 3 domains in higher order thinking skill, the first is analyzing (C4), the second is evaluating (C5), and the third is creating (C6). But different like what as
Nitko and Brookhart (2011) state, that the cognitive domains of higher order thinking skills are applying (C3), analyzing (C4), evaluating (C5), and creating (C6). In this study, even the most needed thing is the lesson plan because of the researcher need to know and find out the cognitive domains of higher order thinking skill which appear in English lesson plan, there are some supporting factors to support this study such as syllabus, and the HOTS’s questions with the keywords.

Some explanations of the HOTS domain according to the 2017 Question Writing Guidebook issued by the Education Assessment Center of the Ministry of Education and Culture's Balitbang (Yuliati & Lestari, 2018; Abrami et al., 2015). The first is Remember (C1), is the most basic level of cognitive processing, where the students remember what they have seen, heard, or learned without any change on their own thoughts. The second is Understand (C2), is an understanding to understand what is accepted by the students, besides that the students can apply it into different way. The third is Apply (C3), is the ability to use methods/concepts/principles/theories that have been obtained by the students, so that they can be applied to their environment. The fourth is Analyze (C4), is the ability to analyze or break down something received into its constituent parts, so that something can be understood by the student. The fifth is Evaluate (C5), is the ability to make decisions, the rest is required to be able to make decisions from something that is accepted, so the students can evaluate from their decisions. The last is Create (C6), is the ability to produce something new, able to formulate/design or plan and then they can produce an original work. Even though the domains of higher order thinking skills are the analyzing, the evaluating, and the creating, the teachers in preparing learning for students must cover those 6 domains in HOTS-based learning.

Lesson Plan (RPP) being one of the administrations for teachers which provides several steps for teachers to teaches the students in class to achieve the learning goals (Sesiorina, 2014; Widodo & Kadarwta, 2013). RPP is not just administration written, but can also be in the form of a teacher's thoughts before teaching in class, such as inviting students to talk in class and inviting students to be active in class (Woodward, 2001). In this research, there are four lesson plans was identified by the researcher, and all lesson plan has different indicators with its operational verbs which belongs to lower order thinking skill and higher order thinking skill. As what mentioned above in the Table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Anderson et al. (2001), there are several words belongs to lower order thinking skill and higher order thinking skill. According to the Table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Krathwohl & Anderson, and C1, C2, and C3 are belongs to lower order thinking skill, then C4, C5, and C6 are belongs to higher order thinking skill, and also it is called as cognitive domain in it.

Shen et al. (2007) argue about the importance of making lesson plans to support the learning process such in the classroom so that students can follow the instructions given by the teacher through the lesson plans. And the teacher has to categorize well the cognitive domain in higher order thinking skill to put in the lesson plans. So that, later on the material and learning strategies will be applied through the lesson plan which to guide in a learning process, we can design what learning will take place and can achieve the desired goals in the learning process (Febrina et al., 2019; Hidayat, 2019).
In order to support this research, the researcher explains some previous related research which can be used as guidance of this research. The first is, Indriyana and Kuswandono (2019) who conducted a study about Developing Students’ Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS) in Reading: English Teachers’ Strategies in Selected Junior High Schools. This study has purposes in describing the teachers’ strategies in developing HOTS in teaching reading skills. In this research mixed-method used for analyzing, as it is relevant to the methodology needed in this study. This study was taken with some limitations because it only investigated the teachers’ strategies using HOTS in teaching reading skills.

The second is Putra and Abdullah (2019) who conducted a study about “Higher-Order Thinking Skill (Hots) Questions in English National Examination in Indonesia.” In order to fulfill the gap, the present study try to identify the use of HOTS-based questions and what particular skills appearing under HOTS category in English National Examination. There is strong statement in this study to motivate the test developers to show adequate portions of HOTS-based items in English National Examination. The test developers of English National Examination are motivated to give more attention to evaluative questions in order to lead students to have the opportunity to express their opinions, feelings, and attitudes by themselves in independent way which stimulates their way to be creative and innovative thinkers (Ahmad, 2016).

The third is Warmadewi et al. (2017), who talk about Analysis of Learning Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS) toward English subject in SMA Negeri 2 Banjar in the Academic Year of 2018/2019. This research has purpose to analyze the implementation of Higher Order Thinking Skill (HGTS) in terms of designing the content of lesson plans and assessments at SMA Negeri 2 Banjar. Qualitative research used in this research employing a document study design. To collect the data qualitatively, the way is through observation, documentation, and interview. And the result of this research was in several parts of the lesson plan and the assessment, and in the whole lesson plan there was not expressed the Higher Order Thinking Skill (HOTS).

Based on the above phenomena, in this study the new thing is identify about the content’s lesson plans and the learning activities, which is in the other research is didn’t conduct about it. And also, the importance of integrating higher order thinking skills in the classroom for students, as purposes of this study is to explore the domain of higher order thinking skills in the eleventh grade English lesson plans at SMK Negeri 1 Singaraja, and also the most dominant cognitive domain.

Based on the research background above, some research problems that can be formulated are:

1. What are the cognitive domains of Higher Order Thinking Skills that appear in the four English Lesson Plans in eleventh grade?
2. What is the most dominant cognitive domain of Higher Order Thinking Skill used in the four English lesson plans in eleventh grade?

METHOD

In this study, descriptive qualitative research used because this method was suitable with the purpose of this study about the Identification of Higher Order Thinking Skill Domain in the eleventh grade English Lesson Plan at SMK N 1 Singaraja. According to Lambert and Lambert (2012), descriptive qualitative is a
method which used to analyze the knowledge of a subject in a particular thing. Descriptive qualitative research design describes and explains the situation of the phenomenon such as word or sentences in this research.

The subjects of this research were the English teachers in SMKN 1 Singaraja. Besides, teacher’s documents (English lesson plan) of Vocational High School were also used as the subject of this present research.

To collect the data, there were several techniques needed in this research. The data were collected through observation and an interview. Then, to obtain the data in the field, the researcher employed document instruments. And the main instrument of this research was the researcher itself and supported by the other instruments such as documentation (lesson plan), checklist and interview guide.

After collecting the data, researcher analyzed the data. It can be defined as the process of identifying the data required from the result of the research. Qualitative data was required from the result of the research. The data were analyzed through the following steps; analysis, identification, classification, and interpretation.

**FINDINGS & DISCUSSIONS**

In this study, there are two research problems which answer through the data collected by the researcher. The research problems are what are the cognitive domains of Higher Order Thinking Skill appear in the eleventh grade English Lesson Plan in grade eleventh and what is the most dominant cognitive domain of Higher Order Thinking Skill used in English lesson plan. There are four lesson plans of eleventh grade used by the teacher in SMK N 1 Singaraja, and here the researcher needs to find out the cognitive domain in lesson plan at SMK N 1 Singaraja. In the lesson plans that has given by the teacher, based on the source of lesson plan instrument by Widi Kariyanto (2017) as cited in Bloom Taxonomy there were some components attached in the checklist which support the findings of this research based on the interview. Beside the checklist document, the teacher in SMK N 1 Singaraja which be the subject of this research stated that the content of the lesson plans is quite complete, based on the interview doing by the researcher.

“The lesson plans used as the tools in teaching the students was taken from the syllabus from the government. Then we as the teacher made it appropriate with the subject learning and conducted to the related material”.

“Here, the teacher makes the lesson plan depends on their ability, the previous lesson plan is thicker and more comprehensive, but the new lesson plan is only one page, but I still use the thick one because it is more comprehensive”.

And here based on the interview with teacher in SMK N 1 Singaraja, he stated was mentioned all the questions in the lesson plans. Then, the researcher went to the document and doing comparing between them, and it is found that the teacher has already put them.

**The Cognitive Domain in English Lesson**

After the researcher check the data and doing identified in all lesson plans and also based on the explanation above which be the content of the lesson plan
itself, it is found that there are two cognitive domains that appear in all lesson plans. 

(1) In the first lesson plan about Suggestion and Offering Help, the researcher found one cognitive domain (C4) in basic competency and in the indicator, with two operational verbs those are menyusun / arrange (C4) and mendemonstrasikan / demonstrate (C4). And also, the evaluation of the cognitive domain in the learning activities, it was found in the second meeting.

   - Siswa diminta membuat kalimat asking for suggestion dari kalimat tersebut, dan menulisnya di papan.

   In the sentence above, in the main activity it was found arrange activity, that the students should create in order to arrange a sentence about asking for suggestion. And the next is demonstrate, it was found in the second meeting

   h. Siswa mempresentasikan dialog yang sudah dibuat.

   In the sentence above, in the main activity it was found demonstrate activity, that the students should demonstrate their work to their friends.

   And also, in the learning activities related to the cognitive domain of higher order thinking skill was identified. In appendix 2, in the first lesson plan it was found in basic competency and indicators, there are two operational verbs in basic competencies and three operational verbs in indicators. Apply is belongs to C3, and arrange is belongs to C6. Determine belongs to C3, use belongs to C3, and demonstrate belongs to C6. And in the learning activities in the first and second meeting, apply found in the main activities, because the students apply the material in the main activity. Arrange found in the main activity that the students are asked to make sentence asking for suggestion and write it on the board. Determine was found in the main activity in the first meeting, that the students match problem with suggestion and response, and also found the expression asking and giving from the task that they made then add it in the observation column. Use was found in the first meeting in main activity, that the students used the material through a game “what’s my problem?”. And demonstrate found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students presenting the dialogue was make by the students.

(2) In the second lesson plan about Asking and giving about opinion and thought, the researcher also found one cognitive domain (C4), with two operational verbs those are menyusun / arrange (C4) and mendemonstrasikan / demonstrate (C4) in basic competency and indicator. And for the evaluation of the cognitive domain in the learning activities, it was found in the second meeting.

   8. Siswa secara berpasangan menyusun dialog singkat dan sederhana tentang menyetujui pendapat dan pendapatnya terkait dengan upaya menjaga, memelihara dan memperbaiki hal yang diinani tadi.

   In the sentence above, in the main activity it was found arrange activity, that the students should arrange a dialogue about asking and giving opinion. And the next is demonstrating, it was found in the second meeting
In the sentence above, in the main activity it was found demonstrate activity, that the students should demonstrate their work in front of the class.

In the learning activities related to the cognitive domain of higher order thinking skill was identified. In appendix 2, in the second lesson plan it was found in basic competency and indicators, there are two operational verbs in basic competencies and three operational verbs in indicators. Apply is belongs to C3, and arrange is belongs to C6. Determine belongs to C3, use belongs to C3, arrange is belongs to C6, and demonstrate belongs to C6. And in the learning activities in the first and second meeting, apply found in the main activities, because the students apply the material in the main activity. Arrange found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students arrange a short dialogue in pair about express their opinion and thoughts. Determine found in the first meeting in main activity, that the students in group doing task 1 to register expression of asking and giving information. Use found in the first meeting in main activity, that the students doing task 2 in pair to fill in the gap dialogue related to expression of asking and giving information. And the last demonstrate found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students in pair will practice their dialogue in front of the class.

(3) Then, in the third lesson plan about Invitation letter (see appendix 5), the researcher found two cognitive domains (C4) & (C6) in basic competency and indicator, with three operational verbs those are capture meaning (C4), arrange (C6), summarize (C4). And for the evaluation of the cognitive domain in the learning activities, it was found in the first meeting.
And in the third meeting of the lesson plan above, in main activity it was also found arrange activity, that the students should create in order to arrange an invitation letter.

And the last is summarize, it was found in the third meeting

The last is summarizing, the third meeting of the lesson plan above it was found in main activity, that the students should write the information that they got from the invitation letter given by other group, then they will explain to their friends in front of the class.

In the learning activities related to the cognitive domain of higher order thinking skill was identified. In appendix 2, in the third lesson plan it was found in basic competency and indicators, there are three operational verbs in basic competencies and four operational verbs of in indicators. Differentiate belongs to C3, capture meaning belongs to C4, and arrange belongs to C6. Compare belongs to C2, determine belongs to C3, summarize belongs to C4, and arrange belongs to C6. And in the learning activities first meeting, it was found differentiate in main activity, that the students given the second letter to do an analysis in order to differentiate the first and second letter. Capture meaning found in the first meeting in opening activity, that the teacher gives some questions to the students in order to make the students capture the meaning about today’s learning material. Arrange found in main activity in the second and third meeting, that the students should re arrange the random formal invitation letter given by the teacher, and in the third meeting that students doing task 4 which create in order to arrange a formal invitation letter suitable with the theme given. Compare found in the main activity in first meeting, that the students doing task 1 and comparing the new invitation letter with the latest invitation letter which they previously discussed. Determine found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students doing task 2 to re arrange in order to determining the random invitation become a unified whole. And summarize found in the third meeting in main activity, that the students write the information contained in the invitation letter given by another group.

And for the evaluation of the cognitive domain in the learning activities, it was found in the first meeting.
In the sentence above, in the opening activity it was found capture meaning activity, that the students try to capture the meaning from the questions given by the teacher.

And in the fourth meeting of the lesson plan above, in main activity it was also found arrange activity, that the students should re arrange two analytical expository texts given by the teacher.

And the last is create, it was found in the first, and fourth meeting.

In the sentence above in first meeting, in main activity it was found create activity, that the students should create a mind mapping based on the analytical exposition text given.

And in the fourth meeting of the lesson plan above, in main activity it was also found create activity, that the students should create an analytical expository based on the issue given by the teacher.

In the learning activities related to the cognitive domain of higher order thinking skill was identified. In appendix 2, in the third lesson plan it was found in basic competency and indicators, there are three operational verbs in basic competencies and seven operational verbs in indicators. Differentiate belongs to C3, capture meaning belongs to C4, and arrange belongs to C6. Identify belongs to C1, explain belongs to C1, compare belongs to C2, describe belongs to C1, determine belongs to C3, complete belongs to C4, create belongs to C4. In the learning activities, differentiate found in the first meeting in main activity, that the students write the important and difficult words from the video, which indicate the students to differentiate between some words they found. Capture meaning found in the first meeting in opening activity, that the students get a question about agreeing should use a mask, which indicate the students to get the meaning through today’s material.

Arrange found in the fourth meeting in main activity, that the students re arrange 2 analytical expository texts based on jumbled paragraphs. Identify found in meeting1-4 in main activity, that the students should observe in order to identify the videos or the texts given by the teacher. Explain found in the first meeting in main activity, that the through group representative explain the mind mapping in front of the class. Compare found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students consecutively read the analytical exposition text prepared by the teacher. Describe found in the second meeting in main activity, that the students in group presenting their result discussion in front of the class. Determine found in the third meeting in main activity, that the students answer in order to determine the answer related to the text observed in pair. Complete found in the third meeting in main activity, that the students complete the blank text given based on the information get from the audio listened. And the last is create found in first and fourth meeting in main activity, that the students create a mind mapping, and in the fourth meeting
the students in pair create an analytical expository text based on the issue given by the teacher.

From all of the identification and an analysis was done by the researcher which about the discussion of the finding cognitive domains in those four lesson plans at SMK N 1 Singaraja, there are two cognitive domains (C4 & C6) that appeared in the whole lesson plans which found by the researcher, within consist of two operational verbs of two cognitive domains each in the first and second lesson plan, and three operational verbs of two cognitive domains each in the third and fourth lesson plan. It means that, the teacher has applied higher order thinking skill when teaching the student through the lesson plans.

**The Most Dominant Cognitive Domain Appear in English Lesson Plan**

After finding the cognitive domains in all English lesson plans at SMK N 1 Singaraja, here is the finding of the most dominant cognitive domain appear in all English lesson plans. The most dominant cognitive domain in all lesson plans can be found through identify the lesson plan one by one. Then, based on the identified in the lesson plan 1-4, it was found that only one cognitive domain that is (C6) menyusun / arrange. In the first lesson plan the most dominant cognitive is C6 (arrange & demonstrate), with different operational verb of cognitive domain.

As what was mention above, the researcher found two operational verbs of one cognitive domain in the first lesson plan, there are arrange and demonstrate. If we doing an identification again in the table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Anderson et al. (2001) above, arrange is the part of C6 and demonstrate is also the part of C6. It means that both of them are the cognitive domains in the first lesson plan which talk about Suggestion and Offering Help. Because in the first lesson plan the researcher only got two operational verbs in one cognitive domain, the most dominant cognitive domain appear in the first lesson plan is C6 (arrange & demonstrate).

In the second lesson plan, it was found two same operational verbs of cognitive domains (C6) in basic competency and indicator, the most cognitive domain is (C6) arrange. The same operational verbs of one cognitive domain got in the second lesson plan which talk about Asking and Giving Opinion and Thought, they are arrange and demonstrate. In the table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Anderson et al. (2001), in C6 there is a word “arrange” and a word “demonstrate”. Same as the first lesson plan, because based on the identification was doing by the researcher in the second lesson plan only found two different operational verbs in one cognitive domain, so the most cognitive domain founded in the second lesson plan is C6 (arrange & demonstrate).

Then in the third lesson plan, also found three operational verbs of cognitive domains (C4 & C6), and the most dominant cognitive domain is C4. As the researcher found above, in the third lesson plan the researcher found three operational verbs of two cognitive domains, they are capture meaning, arrange, and summarize. Based on the table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Anderson et al. (2001), in the lesson plan which talk about Invitation Letter, capture meaning is the part of C4, arrange is the part of C6, and summarize is also the part of C4. In this lesson plan, the researcher also found three different operational verbs of cognitive domains, and the most cognitive domain in the third lesson plan is C4 (capture meaning & summarize).
Lastly, in the fourth lesson plan, also found three operational verbs of cognitive domain (C4 & C6), but the most dominant of cognitive domain is C6. The last in the fourth lesson plan, the researcher also found three operational verbs of two cognitive domains, they are capture meaning/C4, arrange/C6, and create/C6. Same as the three previous lesson plans above, in this lesson plan which talk about Analytical Exposition, only the different operational verbs of two cognitive domains founded. On the table of Domain Cognitive Taxonomy Bloom Revised by Krathwohl & Anderson, capture meaning is the part of C4, arrange is the part of C6, and also create is the part of C6. Based on identification was done by the researcher, in this fourth lesson plan C6 (arrange & create) is the most dominant cognitive domain founded.

From all lesson plans that has identified by the researcher, in each lesson plan there are two different most cognitive domain founded in the four lesson plans. Because every lesson plan has one or two different cognitive domains. If the researcher doing a combination between those four lesson plans, it can be found the most cognitive domain in general around those lesson plan in SMK N 1 Singaraja. So, the most dominant cognitive domains in the eleventh grade English lesson plans at SMK N 1 Singaraja is C6 (arrange). Arrange is the part of C6, which is one of the most dominant cognitive domains which used in lesson plan is quite important, because creating something can make the students to think harder to improve their creativity and exactly have more skill in higher order thinking skill. Because what is happening now in 2013’s curriculum is the students should more active than the teacher in class. And the teacher is required to be more mature in preparing the materials to be taught to the students. And also, this study is can be the basis for getting to know the lesson plan more deeply for the teacher to preparing a lesson plan to teach the students.

REFERENCES


